



**\*Special Meeting of the Oakland Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission**

**Agenda  
Wednesday, February 10, 2021, 4:30 P.M.  
Zoom Teleconference**

1. CALL TO ORDER: 4:36PM
2. ROLL CALL:  
**ALLEN, DUHE, HA, KOS-READ, MOORE, REILLY, SMITH, TORRES, WALTON**

Present: Commissioners Duhe, Ha, Moore, Reilly, Smith, Torres, Walton

Arrivals: Commissioner Kos- Read (4:41PM)

Excused: Commission Allen

3. DISPOSITON OF MINUTES:
  - January 13, 2021 Minutes

**Motion:** Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to approve the January 13, 2021 minutes. **Moved by:** Commissioner Ha. **Second by:** Commissioner Torres. **Vote 7:** Yes 6 - Ha, Moore, Reilly, Smith, Torres, Walton. Abstain 1 - Duhe. **Motion:** Pass.

4. OPEN FORUM:
5. MODIFICATIONS TO THE AGENDA:  
NONE
6. CONSENT NEW BUSINESS:

7. NEW BUSINESS:
  - A. **Supplemental Report for Tree Permit Appeal for 0 Carroll Street, Parcel 22-305-16 “Version 3.0”.**

The Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission reviewed the staff report for item 7A introduced by David Moore, Acting Parks and Tree Services Manager with Oakland Public Works (OPW).

**Oakland Public Works – David Moore:**

Staff reminded the Commission that at the January 13, 2021 meeting, the PRAC approved a motion to table the Carroll Street report until the February 10, 2021 meeting. As of this meeting no additional information was included. OPW recommended that

PRAC deny the tree appeal. OPW staff acknowledged appreciation for the Commission's position to render a decision to recommend preservation or removal of the trees in question. Further, that it was important for the City to merely consider if the trees are candidates for removal as specified in the Ordinance if the criteria for safety or health is met. Staff offered that these decisions appear at times when public opinion is different or moves in the opposite direction.

**Appellant – Greg Clark:**

The Appellant asserted that the Applicant intends to prepare the property for development and should be referred to the City for a Development Permit. Additionally, the Appellant cited the #7 acacia tree as a potential hazard and good candidate for removal. However, he viewed the remaining 6 trees a low risk, and referred to recent high winds where trees around Oakland sustained limb failure where these did not. The Appellant proposed that the Tree Division does not use industry forms showing very low to high, long term or eminent risk failures. And added, that the City will not request or consider the opinion of other arborists. The Appellant maintained that the City was not paying attention to health concerns related to the loss of the tree canopy. And that if the Applicant's Tree Removal Permit was approved, the City would be affirming its disinterest in public health. The Appellant reiterated their request that the Applicant be referred to the City as a Development Permit.

**Applicant – Andy Colvin Representing, Barry Cohn, Trustee of Janet A. Martin Trust:**

The Applicant's representative asserted that the City's arborists are independent and experienced, and other arborist would not solve the problem at hand. Moving forward with the report before the Commission was recommended. The Applicant's representative also asserted that the Applicant did not like the liability, and that the report cited the trees to be dangerous. He added that, no one else would assume liability, and that it was not reasonable to place all the responsibility on one property owner. Applicant's representative informed the PRAC there were no plans to develop on the property and bottom believes it will be kept as a vacant parcel. Remarks were made that the City's policy to retain trees was not iron clad, and that the Ordinance is not the best, but improvements could be made. He concluded that PRAC was obligated to work with in the Ordinance.

The Chair sought clarifying questions from the Commission. Receiving no response, the Chair moved to comments from the Tree Committee.

David Moore reported that he, Commissioner Ha. Tod Lawsen – City Arborist, and Berry Cohn met to review the trees and documents. He reported a subsequent meeting with Tod Lawsen in which they discussed the tree permit, and the status of Oakland's forest and canopy issues. A summary of that conversation informed the Commission that no precedent exists in the Ordinance for phasing tree removals, and

that the City could be held liable for doing so. And that if property were to be developed, the City Council could prioritize and approve it for housing. Staff did not want to speak definitively about City Council decisions.

Staff answered an inquiry regarding notification to 0 Carroll Street apartment building neighbors:

The Commission was informed of the difficulties delivering to apartment complexes including, assessment of fines against the City for dropping information into mailboxes without postage or addressee names. Two notices were delivered to the property owner for distribution.

The Commission acknowledged its obligation to render decisions based on the Tree Ordinance, but also encouraged OPW and the community to work together to address the issues of Oakland's tree canopy. ECAP and the CalFire Grant were referenced for guidance and support. Commissioners commented on the importance of the connection between public health and the Oakland's tree canopy.

OPW recommended the Commission deny the Tree Appeal and uphold the Tree Removal Permit.

**Commission Comments:**

The Commission found that the staff and Tree Committee's review of the Ordinance to be careful and factually presented, and that it was important to uphold the original application to remove the trees. The Commission also recognized the community's interest in having the ECAP incorporated in the Ordinance and asserted that the PRAC views the issue seriously and appreciates the public's concerns.

**Comments from the Chair:**

Recognizing that PRAC is not a legislative body, the Chair expressed a desire to work with the community to develop a better Ordinance that addresses development and non-development permits triggered by the application process.

**Motion:** Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to deny the appeal and uphold the tree removal permit for 0 Carroll Street. Moved by: Commissioner Moore. Second by: Commissioner Torres. **Vote 8:** Yes 7 - Duhe, Ha, Kos-Read, Moore, Smith, Torres, Walton. No 1 - Reilly. **Motion:** Pass.

**B. Request for the Parks And Recreation Advisory Commission to review and update ad-hoc committees, liaison, and mentorship assignments.**

The Commission reviewed templates to update ad-hoc committees, liaison, and mentorship assignments. Positions were traded and accepted.

**Motion:** Commissioner Reilly entertained a motion to approve the PRAC updated ad-hoc committees, liaison, and mentorship assignments. **Moved by:** Commissioner Duhe and **Second by:** Commissioner Kos-Read. **Vote 8:** Yes 8: Duhe, Ha, Kos-Read, Moore, Reilly, Smith, Torres, Walton. Motion: Pass.

8. PLANNING AND CONDITIONAL USE PERMITS:

9. MEASURE Q: OVERSIGHT/UPDATES/REPORTS:

**Brian Carthan – OPW Parks Services Manager:**

A brief regarding hiring staff per Measure Q was provided.

- Oakland Public Works (OPW) is in the process of hiring 27 gardeners. Notices were sent for scheduled exams. Due to Covid-19, the team is working with personnel to develop the process.
- OPW is moving forward to complete the hiring of custodial and maintenance workers. Covid-19 has also delayed this process. The department has made hiring of gardeners and custodians a priority.

Chair Reilly - Looking forward to meeting with the Measure Q Committee.

10. UPDATE FROM THE DIRECTOR, COMMITTEES, RECREATION ADVISORY COUNCILS, & ANNOUNCEMENTS:

**Director's Report:**

Unfortunately, due to the budget restrictions and Covid-19, the majority of OPRYD's programs are closed including pools and Rotary Nature.

Reopened recreation centers serving 70 kids during 2 all day and 2 half day sessions

Departments were required to submit 2 budget proposals showing 10% and 20% reductions.

OPRYD is facing a freeze on 20 critical positions.

The department is working to develop:

- Town Camp and Town Camp Enrichment for Summer Programs – 5 Core Areas to be implemented:
  - Youth Sports
  - Boating
  - Aquatics
  - East Oakland Sports Center
  - Cultural Arts

The 20% budget allow the department to operate at the bare minimum.

More information will be provided after the presentation to the Sugar Sweeten Beverage Tax (SSBT) Board in March.

**Announcements:**

The community engagement process for San Antonio Park has started with funding cited through Measure KK (2016). Concerns have been raised regarding loss of green space and moving Fire Station #4 to one corner of the park. There will be a total of 3 community meetings – the next will be held in March. Visit the Oakland City website and give your email address to receive updates.

Commissioner Duhe suggested there be a 5-minute meet and greet for the Commission.  
Commissioner Walton suggested a specific time to place items on the agenda.  
Measure Q Staff, Sean Maher - Looking forward to meeting the Commission

11. OPEN FORUM CONTINUED:

11. ADJOURNMENT: 7:29PM

**Next Meeting:**

***Wednesday, March 10, 2021***

***Zoom Teleconference***

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ J. Nicholas Williams  
J. Nicholas Williams  
Secretary

/s/ Diane Boyd  
Diane Boyd  
Acting Recording Secretary

**Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission**  
**Mentor Assignments to OPRYD Staff & Recreation Centers/Programs/Facilities**

<b>Vacant</b>	<b>Vacant</b>	<b>Donna DUHE</b>	<b>Princess ALLEN</b>	<b>Jinhee HA</b>	<b>Sheryl WALTON</b>	<b>Peter MOORE</b>	<b>Coire REILLY</b>	<b>Kenzie SMITH</b>	<b>Evelyn TORRES</b>	<b>Isaac KOS-READ</b>
<b><u>Charles Porter Golden Gate</u></b> Kola Thomas 597-5032	<b><u>Arroyo Viejo</u></b> Cynthia Armstrong 615-5764	<b><u>Aquatics</u></b> William Davis, Jr. 615-5838	<b><u>deFremery</u></b> Valorie Winn 238-7739	<b><u>Boating</u></b> Gabriel Gipson 238-2196	<b><u>Dunsmuir Hellman Estate</u></b> Darrin Hodges 615-5555	<b><u>Allendale</u></b> Rodney Williams 535-5635	<b><u>Bushrod</u></b> George Henderson 597-5031	<b><u>Manzanita</u></b> Carmen Medina 535-5625	<b><u>Carmen Flores</u></b> Tony Sirivongsa 535-5631	<b><u>Community Gardens</u></b> Karen ("Yogi") Francis 238-2197
<b><u>Franklin</u></b> Rebecca Chhom 238-7741	<b><u>Brookdale/Discovery</u></b> Rodney Williams 535-5635	<b><u>Montclair</u></b> Jessica Bustos 482-7812	<b><u>Ira Jenkins /EOSC</u></b> Armond Gray 615-5838	<b><u>F.M. Smith</u></b> Carlos Vargas 238-7742	<b><u>Malonga Center for the Arts</u></b> Darrin Hodges 238-7217	<b><u>Dimond</u></b> Alonna Mellion 482-7831	<b><u>Redwood Heights</u></b> Breht Clark 428-7827	<b><u>Studio One Art Center</u></b> Alethia Walker 597-5027	<b><u>Lincoln Square</u></b> Gilbert Gong 238-7738	<b><u>Rotary Nature Center</u></b> Joe Moore 238-3739
		<b><u>Rainbow &amp; Teen Center</u></b> Horace Houston 615-5751	<b><u>Mosswood</u></b> Terri Westbrook 597-5038	<b><u>San Antonio</u></b>	<b><u>Sheffield Village</u></b> Justice Bolden		<b><u>Open Space</u></b> Nature Supervisor (vacant)	<b><u>Sports/ Tennis/ Golf</u></b> Myka Hammock 238-3896	<b><u>Tassafaronga</u></b> Angelica Lopez 615-5764	
			<b><u>Willie Keys</u></b> Vinzuela "V" Bolden 597-5042							

**PRAC**  
**Ad Hoc Committees & Liaisons**

Tree Advisory	1. Peter Moore 2. Jinhee Ha 3.
Measure Q Staff: Sean Maher	1. Princess Allen 2. Coire Reilly 3. Donna Duhe
Tree Inventory & Urban Forest Master Plan Staff: Identify from OPW	1. Peter Moore 2. Jinhee Ha
Park Rules & Regulations Staff: Gail McMillon	1. Coire Reilly 2. Donna Duhe 3. Isaac Kos-Read 4. Jinhee Ha
Lake Merritt Task Force / Mobile Vending	1. Princess Allen 2. Isaac Kos-Read 3. Kenzie Smith 4. Evelyn Torres
<i>Liaison to Friends of the Gardens at Lake Merritt</i>	Isaac Kos-Read
<i>Liaison to Oakland Public School / Joint Use</i>	Evelyn Torres
<i>Liaison to Oakland Zoo</i>	Peter Moore
<i>Liaison to Oakland Parks and Recreation Foundation</i>	Chair
<i>Liaison to Friends of Joaquin Miller Park</i>	

**Dormant Committees**

Golf Advisory <i>Dormant</i>	1. 2.
Special Events <i>Dormant</i>	1. 2.
Naming Rights	1. 2.
Central Reservation Permit Policy Staff: Zermaine Thomas / Darrin Hodges	1. 2.
Public Safety Advisory <i>Dormant</i>	1. 2.
Dog Play Areas <i>Dormant</i>	1. 2.