



Vien Truong, Chair
C. Blake Huntsman, Vice Chair
Michael Colbruno
Chris Pattillo
Jonelyn Whales
Madeleine Zayas-Mart

May 16, 2012
Regular Meeting

ROLL CALL

Present: Truong, Huntsman, Colbruno, Pattillo, Zayas-Mart (left at 7:45 P.M).

Excused: Whales

Staff: Scott Miller, Elois Thornton, Laura Kaminski, Edward Manasse, Peterson Vollman, Mark Wald, Cheryl Dunaway.

WELCOME BY THE CHAIR

Agenda Discussion

Item #1 has been removed from this agenda.

Director's Report

Staff Member Elois Thornton gave a presentation on the West Oakland Specific Plan – which involves the development of comprehensive, multi-faceted strategies for facilitating the development of vacant and underutilized commercial and industrial properties within West Oakland Opportunity Areas and answered questions asked by the Planning Commission.

For further information on any case listed on this agenda, please contact the case planner indicated for that item. For further information on Historic Status, please contact the Oakland Cultural Heritage Survey at 510-238-6879. For other questions or general information on the Oakland City Planning Commission, please contact the Community and Economic Development Agency, Planning and Zoning Division, at 510-238-3941.

♿ This meeting is wheelchair accessible. To request materials in alternative formats, or to request an ASL interpreter, or assistive listening device, please call the *Planning Department at 510-238-3941* or TDD 510-238-3254 at least three working days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting so attendees who may experience chemical sensitivities may attend. Thank you.



Commissioner Zayas-Mart inquired about conflicts with truck traffic noise along 7th Street. What efforts are being taken to coordinate with other agencies to explore alternate routes and how likely are they interested in working with the City of Oakland to resolve the truck traffic issue? Will public housing in the area be considered for development as a part of this project?

Commissioner Pattillo inquired about BART' s transit oriented plan and how to get around the obstacles that has prevented them from implementing the plan to date.

Chair Truong inquired if any community groups assisted with the project development to date. She recommended that EBALC be one of the Community Groups to reach out to for assistance with further development of this project. She also inquired if there is collaboration linking strategies between the Broadway Valdez project and West Oakland Specific Plan project. With 1 out of 4 children having asthma in the area, has there been any movement working on how to reduce the carbon emissions and greenhouse gas toxins in the area.

Staff Member Elois Thornton responded to all of the Planning Commission' s questions.

Commission Matters

Commissioner Colbruno inquired if the applicant filed an appeal on the Planning Commission' s denial of the Dog Park Project. Interim Director Scott Miller responded to his inquiry.

City Attorney 's Report

City Attorney Mark Wald gave a report on the status of the Knowland Park Zoo project. The Courts upheld the approval decisions made by both the Planning Commission and the City Council.

OPEN FORUM

Speaker: John Gatewood.

At the request of Chair Truong, Interim Director Scott Miller explained why The City doesn't pay for public transportation passes for attendees of the Planning Commission Meetings even though they offer free parking at the City Hall garage.



NOTE: ITEM #1 HAS BEEN REMOVED FROM THIS AGENDA

1.	Approximate Location:	Near 2824 Burton Drive (in the City Right Of Way) (APN:048D-7296-037-05)
	Proposal:	To install two (2) concealed antenna panels on a new 10'-3" high pole extension located on top of the existing 34'-0" high PG&E pole, thus increasing its height to 44'-3" high, and to install concealed equipment cabinets mounted on the pole about 8'-0" high from finished street grade in the City Right-of-Way.
	Owner/Contact:	Northern California Joint Pole Association, Patti Ringo
	Contact Person/Phone Number:	Extenet Systems/Rick Hirsch (415) 377-7826
	Case File Number:	DR11-224
	Planning Permits Required:	Regular Design Review to install and operate a Telecommunications facility in a residential zone.
	General Plan:	Hillside Residential
	Zoning:	RH-4 Hillside Residential Zone-4; and S-10 Scenic Route Combining Zone.
	Environmental Determination:	Exempt, Section 15301 of the State CEQA Guidelines: Existing Facilities (additions to existing structure); Section 15183 of the State CEQA Guidelines: Projects consistent with a Community plan, General Plan or Zoning.
	Historic Status:	Survey Rating: None.
	Service Delivery District:	2
	City Council District:	4
	Date Filed:	12/15/11 (<i>revised design plans submitted on 04/04/12</i>)
	Action to be Taken:	Decision based on staff report
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 calendar days
	For Further Information:	Contact Case Project Planner Mike Rivera at (510) 238-6417, or by email at mriviera@oaklandnet.com

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

2.	Location:	2847 Peralta Street (APN's: 007-0589-016-00; -017-00; -018-02; -018-03;& -023-00)
	Proposal:	Proposal would merge nine existing lots into two lots, one of which would include a condominium development project which was part of previously approved entitlements (CMDV05-476) and the other parcel would be reserved for future use as a Community Garden. The proposal would include a Transfer of Development Rights, pursuant to Planning Code Section 17.106.050, from the parcel reserved for a Community Garden to the development parcel. The Transfer of Development Rights would allow for 90 units maximum on the development parcel. The parcel that would contain the future development currently has entitlements for a mixed use building with 58 dwelling units. A new application would need to be submitted to take advantage of the increased density of 90 total units on the development parcel, and is not part of this application request.
	Applicant:	Peralta Street, LLC
	Contact Person/Phone Number:	Marc Babsin, (415) 489-1313
	Owner:	Peralta Street, LLC
	Case File Number:	CMV12-025 & TPM-10032
	Planning Permits Required:	Major Variance to allow the use of Transfer of Development Rights in the HBX-2 Zone, Major Conditional Use permit for Transfer of Development Rights, and Tentative Parcel Map to merge nine lots into two lots, including for condominium purposes.
	General Plan:	Housing & Business Mix
	Zoning:	HBX-2, Housing and Business Mix Zone - 2
	Environmental Determination:	Exempt, Section 15332 of the State CEQA Guidelines; in-fill development projects; and Section 15183 of the CEQA Guidelines, projects consistent with a community plan, general plan, or zoning.
	Historic Status:	Vacant Lot
	Service Delivery District:	1
	City Council District:	3
	Status:	Pending
	Action to be Taken:	Decision on application based on Staff Report
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 days
	For Further Information:	Contact case planner Peterson Z. Vollmann at (510) 238-6167 or by email: pvollman@oaklandnet.com .

Staff Member Peterson Vollman gave a presentation.

Applicant: Marc Babsin gave a presentation and answered questions asked by the Planning Commission.

Commissioner Colbruno inquired about the City Slicker Farm pertaining to plants, animals or both being raised on the farm and how will the animals be used?

Commissioners Pattillo, Zayas-Mart and Vice Chair Huntsman expressed how pleased they are with the proposed project and fully support it.



Vice Chair Huntsman made a motion to approve, seconded by Commissioner Pattillo.

Action on the matter: Approved 5 ayes, 0 noes.

Chair Truong clearly stated that the Planning Commission withhold judgments about processing and slaughtering of farm animals at tonight's hearing. Interim Director Scott Miller confirmed Chair Truong's statement.

3. **Location:** The Planning Area encompasses approximately 96 acres on either side of Broadway, and is generally bound by Interstate-580 to the north, Grand Avenue to the south, Webster Street and Valley Street to the west, and Harrison Street, Bay Place, 27th Street, Richmond Avenue, and Brook Street to the east.
- Proposal:** Conduct a public scoping session, as required by the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), to receive comments on the scope of a Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) on the Broadway Valdez District Specific Plan.
- Applicant:** City of Oakland
- Case File Number:** ZS12046, ER120005
- General Plan:** Central Business District, Community Commercial, Neighborhood Center Commercial, Urban Residential, Mixed Housing Type Residential, Institutional
- Zoning:** CBD-P, CBD-C, CC-2, CC-2/D-BR, CN-2/D-BR, RU-3/D-BR, RU-4/D-BR, RM-3/D-BR, RM-4/D-BR
- Environmental Determination:** An Environmental Impact Report (EIR) will be prepared for the Broadway Valdez District Specific Plan.
- Historic Status:** The Plan Area includes cultural/historic resources that may be eligible for, or are on an historical resource list (including the California Register of Historic Resources, the National Register of Historical Resources, and/or the Local Register); as well as several cultural/historic resources designated by the City of Oakland as Areas of Primary Importance (API); Areas of Secondary Importance (ASI); properties individually rated A, B, C, or D; and Landmark properties.
- Service Delivery District:** 2
- City Council District:** 3
- Status:** A Notice of Preparation (NOP) of DEIR will be published on April 30, 2012, and the public comment period on the NOP ends on May 30, 2012.
- Action to be Taken:** Receive public and Planning Commissioner comments on the scope of the DEIR. No decisions will be made on the project at this hearing.
- Finality of Decision:** N/A
- For Further Information:** Contact project planner Laura Kaminski at 510-238-6809 or lkaminski@oaklandnet.com
Project message line: 510-238-7905
Project email address: bvdsp@oaklandnet.com
Project website: www.oaklandnet.com/bvdsp

Staff Member Edward Manasse gave a powerpoint presentation and answered questions asked



Commissioner Pattillo asked Staff Member Ed Manasse to describe the process where staff define the alternatives that will be studied. She also asked the following two questions: Why is there a proposal to build a hotel and why is there two areas identified as adaptive reuse priority areas in the Valdez Triangle? Staff Member Edward Manasse and City Attorney Mark Wald responded to Commissioner Pattillo's questions.

Speakers: Ken Lowney, Jeff Neustadt, Francine Williams, Moises Aceves, Naomi Schiff, Marla Wilson, William Purcell, Rob Stoker, Valerie Winemiller, John Gatewood, Solomon Ets-Hokin, Joyce Ray, Liza Pratt, Richard Quach, Nathan Landou, Neil Saxby, Joel Ramos, Thomas Biggs.

Planning Commission Comments and Questions:

Commissioner Zayas-Mart would like to maintain the flexibility in the plan and encourages mixed use housing along the Broadway corridor. She would like for the applicant to think of alternatives to retail building, and to have an equal amount of retail and living space development, preferably retail space above the living space. She also supports affordable housing and the two sided street idea with compatible characters. She stated that safety along the major corridor is very important and welcomed the public to contact her if they have any further concerns or questions about the proposed project. She is in support of this proposed project.

Commissioner Pattillo expressed how pleased she is with the graphics, text and overall presentation of the documented plans provided with the staff report. She also thanked the public for taking time to review the staff report and submit thoughtful comments on this proposed project. She would like to see in the Environmental Impact Report (EIR), both north and south end boundaries expanded particularly underneath Highway 580 and Grand Avenue at the parking area that serves Lucas Tap Room. The number of housing proposed seems too low and would like to see more housing ~~and less retail~~ included in the Environmental Impact Report (EIR). She stated that the Green connection dead ended at 29th Street and would like to see bicycling extended passed Lake Merritt and somehow incorporate it into the Environmental Impact Report (EIR) Strengthening the commitment to the Historical Preservation by using the historic buildings as a foundation for developing this project and preclude moving buildings to assemble a large empty lot should be included in the document. She was pleased that the community gave a wish list of the areas they would like to see studied. She would also like to add to the list, to have the Pergola in Mosswood Park which is very close to the study area. She hopes that Solomon who is one of the public speakers, and has a lot of knowledge about retail will review this staff report and attachments in order to hear his recommendation about how retail may or may not work with this project.

Commissioner Colbruno agreed with the previous comments made from his fellow Commissioners and the public. The bicycle, seniors and the creek are all one issue and would like a resolution addressing the issue incorporated into this project. Large parking garages and more density generally doesn't always work in certain areas in Oakland which may lead to lack of exercise and reduced use of public transportation, bicycles and walking as a part of the daily



commute. He recommended there be a 30,000 ft. thorough view of the area plan to see how a connection between Lake Merritt, Broadway and Chinatown can be utilized as it relates to pedestrian and bicycling and not only when there are certain boundaries that seem to prevent a very thorough view of the area plan. The housing issue is extremely important and would like to see more density included in this proposed project. More vibrant ground floor retail space is greatly needed and he supports the widening of the sidewalks, but is concerned about taking out the medians and would like to see if there is a way to keep the medians. He agrees with Commissioner Pattillo about restoring and reusing historic buildings rather than new construction. He also agrees with extending the plan to Highway 580 particularly activating the underpasses with the idea from City Council to have food trucks and other business vendors utilizing the underpasses. There is a concern about providing successful retail for those who drive, the onramp onto Highway 580 at Broadway seems easily accessible, but the exit from Highway 580 to the same area is not easily accessible. He recommends staff contact the appropriate State of California agency soon in order to include a resolution in the proposed project.

Vice Chair Huntsman raised the question about the relocation of the current businesses and jobs along the Broadway corridor and how is that being resolved? Would like to see quality jobs maintained as a result of adding retail and would prefer if employees that work in the area can also afford to live there. Which City of Oakland policies will be leveraged to ensure that when building in Oakland that quality jobs will be maintained? He stated that overall this is a very good plan and hopes to see and enjoy it when it's completed.

Staff Member Edward Manasse responded to Vice Chair Huntsman's questions and concerns.

Chair Truong commented on some of the unsafe environments in Oakland which prevents her from wanting to ride her bicycle throughout the neighborhood. How will this project improve bicycle safety issues surrounding this area and how will it be addressed? She also recommends adding a bicycle lane into the plan. She encourages flexibility in having ground floor retail and second floor commercial space without disrupting the affordable housing development if funding permits. She recommends keeping 30th and Broadway Streets as part of this plan. Although the underpass questions are being addressed by City Council, she has added a few recommendations on how to use the underpasses more effectively, study the impacts on Lake Merritt and its park on the veterans memorial and park on the mouth of Leneco Creek of intensified zoning and commercial development at the Harrison Street edge of the area. ~~She doesn't recommend that Governor Jerry Brown's 10K Plan be addressed.~~

Staff Member Edward Manasse responded to Chair Truong's questions and concerns.

This item is for discussion only to receive public and Planning Commissioner comments on the scope of the DEIR. No decisions will be made on the project at this hearing.



Approval of Minutes

Approval of the February 25, 2012 minutes have been moved to the June 6, 2012 Planning Commission Meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned at approximately 8:25 P.M.

ROBERT MERKAMP
Acting Zoning Manager
Planning and Zoning Division

NEXT REGULAR MEETING:

June 6, 2012