



Oakland City Planning Commission

Minutes

Viên Truong, Chair
C. Blake Huntsman, Vice Chair
Michael Colbruno
Chris Pattillo
Jonielyn Whales
Madeleine Zayas-Mart

May 2, 2012
Regular Meeting

ROLL CALL

Present: Truong, Huntsman, Pattillo, Whales (arrived at 6:40 P.M.), Zayas-Mart.

Excused: Colbruno.

Staff: Scott Miller, Robert Merkamp, Catherine Payne, Devan Reiff, Ann Clevenger, Heather Lee, Cheryl Dunaway.

WELCOME BY THE CHAIR

Agenda Discussion
heard.

Item #2 and the approval of the minutes were the first to be

For further information on any case listed on this agenda, please contact the case planner indicated for that item. For further information on Historic Status, please contact the Oakland Cultural Heritage Survey at 510-238-6879. For other questions or general information on the Oakland City Planning Commission, please contact the Community and Economic Development Agency, Planning and Zoning Division, at 510-238-3941.

♿ This meeting is wheelchair accessible. To request materials in alternative formats, or to request an ASL interpreter, or assistive listening device, please call the **Planning Department at 510-238-3941** or **TDD 510-238-3254** at least three working days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting so attendees who may experience chemical sensitivities may attend. Thank you.



PUBLIC HEARINGS

1.	Location:	Portion of Coliseum Gardens Master Plan site; specifically, Phase V, located on Lion Way (APN: 041-4212-006-00)
	Proposal:	Amendment to the PUD specific to redesign of Phase V of the Coliseum Gardens Master Plan; redesign to include 128 units of senior housing, 32 parking spaces, 1 loading space and on-site open space.
	Applicant(s):	EBALDC, Ener Chiu, (510) 287-5353 x338
	Owner(s):	Oakland Housing Authority
	Case File Number(s):	REV120005 (revision to PUD03638)
	Planning Permits Required:	Revision to PUD, FDP, tree removal permit, creek protection permit
	General Plan:	Neighborhood Center Commercial
	Zoning:	S-15 Transit-Oriented Development Zone
	Environmental Determination:	Subsequent Mitigated Negative Declaration/Addendum
	Historic Status:	There are no Potential Designated Historic Properties located on the project site.
	Service Delivery District:	V, Central East Oakland
	City Council District:	6 - Brooks
	Status:	Design Review on October 26, 2011
	Action to be Taken:	Consider approval of revision to PUD and related permits
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 days of decision
	For further information:	Contact case planner Catherine Payne at (510) 238-6168 or by email at cpayne@oaklandnet.com

Commissioner Pattillo recused herself from hearing this item due to a conflict of interest.

Staff Member Catherine Payne gave a presentation.

Applicants: Lydia Tam and Ener Chiu gave a presentation and answered questions asked by the Planning Commission such as:

Commissioner Zayas-Mart requested that applicant Ener Chiu explain the bicycle parking on what the Planning Commission is asking and what would he like for them to consider. She would also like to know what is required by code on how many parking units are allowed for this type of project. She requested a reduction in the road width at a previous Design Review Committee Meeting, but it doesn't show that it was addressed in this design included in the Planning Commission staff report. She also expressed the importance of affordable housing as it relates to this project. Vice Chair Huntsman assisted with clarifying the applicant's explanation about the bicycle parking to Commissioner Zayas-Mart.

Commissioner Whales raised the question about the detail in the fencing design which isn't shown in the staff report, and would like to know if the color of the fence will be changed from black to white or will it remain the same.

Chair Truong raised the question of why is the building being changed from multi family units to senior housing and how does this tie into affordable housing? She also asked the applicant to explain the vision and strategy of how they will implement this.



Planning Commission Comments:

Commissioner Whales expressed how pleased she is about the proposal to have senior housing rather than multi family units, and that she fully supports this proposed project.

Vice Chair Huntsman also expressed how pleased he is with the design and is excited about the affordable housing element.

Commissioner Zayas-Mart commended the applicant for taking their (Planning Commission) comments and requests very seriously and including them into the design. She recommended that the developer consider a bulb out in front of the lobby area and additional landscaping in the parking area without reducing some of the parking spaces. She also stated that she supports this proposed project. Staff Member Catherine Payne addressed Commissioner Zayas-Mart's recommendations.

Chair Truong commended the applicants for putting a lot of thought and quality into developing this into a green project. She is also pleased that this development includes affordable senior housing and that transportation and other important amenities were taken into consideration to accommodate the needs of the tenants. She looks forward to watching this proposed grow.

Commissioner Zayas-Mart made a motion to approve, seconded by Vice Chair Huntsman.

Action on the matter: Approved 4 ayes, 0 noes.



2.	Project Title:	Consider a General Plan Amendment to make the Oakland Local Hazard Mitigation Plan (Oakland LHMP) a part of the <i>Safety Element</i> of the Oakland General Plan.
	Location:	Citywide
	Proposal:	Consider a General Plan Amendment, making the Oakland Local Hazard Mitigation Plan (Oakland LHMP) a part of the <i>Safety Element</i> of the Oakland General Plan.
	Applicant:	Strategic Planning Division, City of Oakland
	Contact Person/Phone Number:	Devan Reiff, Planner II, 510-238-3550
	Case File Number:	GP12001
	General Plan:	All designations
	Applicable Zoning:	All zoning districts
	Environmental Determination:	A CEQA Addendum to the 2004 <i>Safety Element Negative Declaration</i> , and other previous CEQA documents, was prepared. As a separate and independent basis, several CEQA exemptions are applicable: CEQA Guidelines Sections 15060, 15061, 15300, 15304, 15330 and 15183.
	Historic Status:	N/A
	Service Delivery District:	All
	City Council District:	All
	Date Filed:	March 20, 2012
	Status:	N/A
	Action to be Taken:	Recommendation to Council for adoption of a General Plan Amendment to make the Oakland Local Hazard Mitigation Plan a part of the <i>Safety Element</i> of the Oakland General Plan.
	Finality of Decision:	Recommendation to Council
	For Further Information:	Contact Devan Reiff, Planner II, at 510-238-3550; or by email: dreiff@oaklandnet.com

Staff Member Devan Reiff gave a presentation.

Vice Chair Huntsman made a motion to approve, seconded by Commissioner Pattillo.

Action on the matter: Approved 4 ayes, 0 noes.



3.	Location:	Lakeview Park, northeast corner at MacArthur Boulevard and Lake Shore Avenue (APN: 011-0836-041-04)
	Proposal:	To establish a Dog Play Area.
	Applicant:	City of Oakland Office of Parks and Recreation
	Contact Person/	Mark Hall
	Phone Number:	(510) 238-3817
	Case File Number:	CU11208
	Planning Permits Required:	A Conditional Use Permit is required to establish a dog play area at an existing neighborhood park.
	General Plan:	Urban Open Space
	Zoning:	OS (NP) - Open Space (Neighborhood Park)
	Environmental	Exempt, Section 15301 of the State CEQA Guidelines:
	Determination:	Existing Public Facilities; Section 15332 of the State CEQA Guidelines: Infill Development Projects; Section 15183 of the State CEQA Guidelines: Projects consistent with a Community Plan, General Plan or Zoning
	Historic Status:	LM1: Lake Merritt Historic District
	Service Delivery District:	3
	City Council District:	3
	Date Filed:	November 9, 2011 (complete on February 23, 2012)
	Action to be Taken:	Decision on Application
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 days of decision
	For Further Information:	Contact case planner Ann Clevenger, Planner III at (510) 238-6980 or aclevenger@oaklandnet.com

Commissioner Pattillo recused herself from hearing this item due conflict of interest.

Due to the high volume of speakers for this item, Interim Director Scott Miller explained the rules of order separating those who would like to speak as groups, individual speakers and those who conceded time to other speakers.

Staff Member Ann Clevenger gave a presentation.

Staff Member Mark Hall from the Office of Parks and Recreation gave a presentation.

Proponents: Emily Rosenberg gave a powerpoint presentation in support of the proposed project.

Opponents: Sue Levin and Brad Mc Crea gave a powerpoint presentation in opposition of the proposed project.

Commissioner Whales asked how the odor from the dog waste will be maintained.

Commissioner Zayas-Mart asked if the applicants considered other sites before deciding on the proposed site.

Speakers: Denise Conley, Patricia Durham, Frank Quattenbaum, Sandra Bradman, Margaret Pinter, Leal-Char-o-nay, Pamela Drake, Gloryanna Valerio-Leonce, Gail Green, Joel Tena, Eric Silver, Wendy, Edie Murphy, David Ralston, Jack Van Voast, Barbst Amant, Meredith Brown, Jane Mc Crea, Alex Amoruso, Matthew Webb, Jerry Wolfe, Gillian Ferraru, Adam Sand, Dale Ridsen, Sam Murchison, Michelle Dong, Darshellia Butler, Sean Sullivan, Rose Works, Peter Grube, Nara Dahlbacka, Kathryn Moll, Liz Fuchs



Paul Hollenbach, Lady Markham, Carlos Rubinstein, Joyce Roy, Young Chang, Richelle Leeberman, Chris Norman, Steve Stafford, Tim Fitzgerald, Lucy Armentrout, Gary Meyer.

Chair Truong read a list of written comments submitted to the Planning Commission of those who are for and against this proposed project. She further explained that the Planning Commission is listening and taking very careful notes during the public comment session, they've read numerous comments sent via email, they've been carefully reviewing the comments for months and will very carefully consider all written and verbal comments before making a vote.

Planning Commission's Questions, Comments and Concerns:

Vice Chair Huntsman thanked the public for coming to attend tonight's meeting to voice their concerns on this proposed project. He raised a concern about the proposed project site, and feels that other sites should be explored before making a final decision. He also stated that safety, aesthetics and various other concerns are factors of why he will not support the proposed project and he recommended that another site be selected.

Commissioner Whales stated that she visited the proposed site for the Dog Park project to get a visual of how it would look there. She found that it didn't seem too intrusive to the section of the lot park in which adults and children use on a daily basis. She is unsure of how she will vote based on the information she has received so far, but she will give it more thought before the time to make a vote.

Commissioner Zayas-Mart expressed various reasons why she will not support the proposed project. Some of the reasons are: the size of the proposed area for the dog park seems too small to share with adults and children that utilize the park area and safety issues concerning the dogs being too close to the other patrons of the park. She stated that she fully understands the need for a dog park, just not at the proposed site. She believes that dogs deserve to have a park of their own and that different site be considered.

Chair Truong stated that she is a dog owner who visits other parks and notices some dogs are not on a leash. This is a safety concern especially when heavy street traffic and children are involved. She doesn't see the need to make changes at the proposed location to create a dog park there. She would like for her dogs to feel and be safe to take to this location, but isn't convinced that she should support this proposed project.

Commissioner Zayas-Mart made a motion to deny, seconded by Vice Chair Huntsman.
Action on the matter: Denied 3 ayes, 1 abstention (Whales).

Approval of Minutes

Vote for the February 25, 2012 minutes has been moved to the May 16, 2012 Planning Commission Meeting.

Commissioner Pattillo made a motion to approve the March 7, 2012 minutes, seconded by Commissioner Zayas-Mart.

Action on the matter: Approved 3 ayes, 0 noes, 1 abstention



Commissioner Pattillo made a motion to approve the March 21, 2012 minutes, seconded by Commissioner Zayas-Mart.

Action on the matter: Approved 3 ayes, 0 noes, 1 abstention (Huntsman).

ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned at approximately 11:15 P.M.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Robert Merkamp', written over the printed name.

ROBERT MERKAMP
Acting Zoning Manager
Planning and Zoning Division

NEXT REGULAR MEETING: May 16, 2012