

Community Education Workshop #2

Event: Community Education Workshop #2: Housing and Environmental Justice

Location: Virtual on Zoom

Date/Time: 4/9/2022 at 9:30AM to 11:00AM

Number of people reached: 40

- 40 attendees

Event Description: Members of Deeply facilitated one of two virtual community education workshops on housing and environmental justice to review the past and present policies that led to today's conditions in housing and environmental justice. The workshop informed people what the General Plan is and grounded community members and City staff in current and historical issues related to housing and environmental justice. With this background information and space to share feedback on potential policies and environmental justice community map, we are working to ensure that residents, whose voices have not historically been part of the process, get to contribute to the development of the General Plan.

The workshop was a collaboration between Just Cities, EastSide Arts Alliance, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project, and The Village. Elena Serrano of EastSide Arts Alliance provided grounding on what is the General Plan. Ms. Margaret Gordon of West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project and Diana Benitez of Just Cities presented on environmental justice issues and potential new policies. Margareta Lin of Just Cities presented on housing conditions and past policies, as well as potential new policies. Needa Bee of The Village presented on conditions and issues among the unhoused community and potential new policies. Open conversation among participants at the end of the workshop, as well as the chat function throughout offered space for residents to share feedback. Interpretation in Spanish and Cantonese was provided. Deeply Rooted staff pointed attendees to the City's [Oakland General Plan website](#) and [Just Cities website](#) for more information.

[Presentation slides](#) and Workshop recording ([English](#), [Spanish](#), and [Cantonese](#)) are available on the City's website.

Engagement Approach: Pose questions to participants about their experiences living in Oakland, especially around housing and environmental justice, and what policies they would like to see.

Demographics: The Deeply Rooted in Oakland Partnership is committed to reaching people who have not traditionally been part of planning processes. To outreach for this workshop, Deeply Rooted members sent an event flyer to their networks and the City sent

Community Education Workshop #2

out the flyer to their OGP listserv and posted on the City website. Members of the Equity Working group also attended. Deeply Rooted did not collect demographic information for this particular workshop, but across events we hope to reach youth, older adults, LGBTQ+ persons, persons with disabilities, formerly incarcerated persons, unhoused folks, tenants/renters, homeowners, low-income persons, and people experiencing environmental injustices.

Engagement Summary

The following is a summary of the main points that community members brought up during the event. Points under each topic are ordered by most to least mentioned.

The meeting started by asking, "What is your biggest wish for Oakland 2045 - 23 years from now?"

OAKLAND 2045

- **We are thriving, healthy and safe:** People described wanting Oakland to be a place where all people have the resources and access to live healthy, abundant, sustainable, culturally rich and happy lives. A place where everyone is housed. The City remains a bastion for culture.
- **Coming home:** People described establishing the "right to return" for folks who have been displaced from Oakland.
- **Engaging youth:** Youth are able to live longer and know that this city and community cares for them.
- **Government partnership with community:** Information, orientation, and implementation not *by* government, but *with* government.

ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE

Issues:

- Green washing
- Jobs being prioritized over environmental and community health

HOUSING

HOUSING AFFORDABILITY

Issues:

- **Racial disparity:** People mentioned that everything [conditions] is worst for Black Americans.
- Even those with the median household income are being priced out of Oakland

Community Education Workshop #2

Solutions:

- **Affordable Housing**
 - City Council should adopt Housing as a Human Right
 - **Preferential Zoning**, where affordable housing zoning could be introduced that would offer subsidies and incentives for specific affordable housing developments.
 - Halfway houses for formerly incarcerated with direct connections to warehousing jobs
 - Continue to partner with churches to use land for affordable housing
- **Market rate:**
 - Moratorium on market rate housing development

DISPLACEMENT

Issues:

- **Racial displacement:** People expressed concern about underproduction of low income housing and over production of market rate housing and its connection to racial displacement; “Why is this not seen as ethnic cleansing - how is it legal to ‘plan’ these displacements into reality? ”

Solutions:

- **Reparations** and legal recourse. Look to organizations such as the American Descendants of Slavery (ADOS) Advocacy Foundation for guidance.
- Having nuanced conversations about immigrant, non-speaking English populations that are moving into neighborhoods experiencing gentrification and displacement.

CITY LEADERSHIP AND COMMUNITY HEALING

“How do we heal internally from the trauma we live in and live with?”

CITY LEADERSHIP

- **Issue:**
 - Public officials are transitory, which makes change more difficult
 - The City is connected to developers and policy people who see people of color as not welcome in Oakland
- **Solutions:**
 - Robust support of community-based organizing as a form of continuity in advancing change
 - Turn to the legal front to promote accountability and advance change
 - Pass the Invest in Our Oakland tax ballot measure

COMMUNITY TRAUMA AND HEALING

Community Education Workshop #2

- **Issue:**
 - Communities in Oakland, especially communities of color, are living with and in ongoing trauma and internalized oppression
 - City plans are moving ahead without community. “Planning sessions” are just a way to seek feedback.

Appendix: Zoom Chat from Workshop Session

11:03:23 From Melody Chang : Please go to the bottom of your screen, select the small Interpretation Globe, and select a language

11:04:48 From Nayeli Bernal : Hi! I'm Nayeli Bernal, mother of three and East Oakland community member. My biggest wish for Oakland is a thriving city where all people have the resources, access, and safety to live healthy, abundant, and happy lives.

11:05:26 From Melody Chang : Thank you Nayeli!

11:06:45 From Melody Chang : Good morning, if you just joined, please go to the bottom of your screen, select the small Interpretation Globe, and select a language

11:06:47 From liz suk : liz suk, she/they - my biggest wish for Oakland is everyone is housed, healthy and thriving.

11:08:24 From amara tabor-smith : greetings everyone! I am zooming in from unneeded Lisjan Ohlone land in West Oakland...my affirmation is for a vibrant thriving Oakland where all folks are HOMEFULL in an environment that is healthy, sustainable and culturally rich...the right to return for folks who have been displaced from Oakland can come home...

11:08:43 From Yik Fai - Cantonese Interpreter : 如想獲得廣東話即時口譯服務，請在工具列上單擊地球圖示選取服務。

11:08:50 From Melody Chang : Thank you liz and amara!

11:09:25 From Ayodele Nzinga : Ayodele Nzinga BAMBD CDC, that Oakland still is home to a range of people of color thriving, housed and healthy in all respects and the city remains a bastion of culture that promotes livity for all residents.

11:14:31 From alicia parker : Information, orientation and implementation, not by govt, but with govt.

Community Education Workshop #2

- 11:15:46 From Marquita Price : Thank you Ms. Margaret!
- 11:16:31 From Esther Goolsby : Esther Goolsby East Oakland biggest wish for Oakland is that the youth be able to live longer and know that this city and community cares for them and that us doing this work engage them. That we don't allow fear to continue to add harm, and not stand up for our health.
- 11:16:43 From James E Vann : What I meant by "West Oakland is missing ?
- 11:16:59 From Liat Meitzenheimer-Fresh Air Vallejo : Thank you Ms. Margaret. Good to see you still fighting the good fight in Oakland.
- 11:17:10 From Esther Goolsby : East Oakland looks so painful!!
- 11:17:30 From Marquita Price : mannnn, that's what I was thinking
- 11:17:35 From Marquita Price : the deep is dark dark
- 11:18:07 From Marquita Price : Everything below e14th street
- 11:18:48 From liz suk : That clarity is important.
- 11:19:03 From Esther Goolsby : We see, breathe and live in these area!!!
- 11:19:14 From Marquita Price : Currently!
- 11:20:01 From Chris Norman : How should folks engage with the general plan process in service of the community's environmental justice goals? What are opportunities to be heard?
- 11:20:04 From Liat Meitzenheimer-Fresh Air Vallejo : Wondering how long Oakland's process is going to take for community outreach?
- 11:21:34 From Chris Norman : i.e., how do we determine what we want to do with this information on EJ?
- 11:21:36 From alicia parker : fighting policies...city, county, state
- 11:22:30 From Margaretta Lin : Yes Esther—thank you for fighting for EJ over the decades! We get to integrate the Healthy Development Guidelines on the General Plan!!!
- 11:22:38 From liz suk : Good morning Esther!!!!
- 11:23:45 From liz suk : thank you Margaret and Esther for all the work rooted in the community.
- 11:23:54 From Melody Chang : Thanks @Chris, this is a workshop to help everyone get on the same page about what's happened in the past to lead us to the current state of things today. The Deeply Rooted collaborative is hosting events throughout Oakland where residents can share their experiences on housing and environmental justice
- 11:24:08 From liz suk : Will we be able to see the map Ms. Margaret is speaking about?
- 11:24:36 From Margaretta Lin : Yes Liz—in the ppt that Diana will be linking to in the chat
- 11:24:47 From Melody Chang : That information gathered through conversations will be brought back to the City and folded into their development of the Plan
- 11:25:19 From Esther Goolsby : No I took my hand down now. thank you

Community Education Workshop #2

- 11:25:32 From liz suk : @Margaretta - to be clear the community based "our" map?
- 11:25:39 From Esther Goolsby : planning dept, permitting
- 11:26:06 From Margaretta Lin : Thanks Liz for that—we're in the process of developing the community based map based upon the community engagement process
- 11:26:21 From liz suk : Thanks
- 11:28:35 From Diana Benitez : Here is the link to today's slides:
<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1yuMM7bmNOI88f0tLkqvFwGvat5k-9k8O/view?usp=sharing>
- 11:29:42 From Esther Goolsby : the neighborhoods move so fast! people are here one minute not this next
- 11:30:02 From amara tabor-smith : Yes, Elena- addressing the trauma is a crucial part of this process I think
- 11:34:33 From liz suk : 2015-2022 is the length of Mayor Libby Schaaf's tenor
- 11:34:37 From liz suk : tenure
- 11:40:03 From liz suk : Need!!!!
- 11:40:09 From liz suk : NEEDA!
- 11:40:34 From liz suk : Request to slow down a little bit.
- 11:41:04 From liz suk : Important framing.
- 11:44:15 From Ayodele Nzinga : Under count
- 11:44:49 From liz suk : Please slow down for interpretation
- 11:47:50 From Esther Goolsby : everything is worst for black americans will anything we do help them specifically so their number wont continue to disappear?
- 11:52:04 From Ayodele Nzinga : Why is it not criminal for a cit to purposely allow its median population to be priced out of a city — when this is expressed in color statistically documented, 90%market rate and underperf
- 11:52:55 From Melody Chang : Thank you Ms. Margaret, Diana, Margaretta, and Needa!
- 11:52:57 From Ayodele Nzinga : Underperforming on low income — why is this not seen as ethnic cleansing— how is it legal to "plan" these displacements into reality
- 11:53:05 From Marquita Price : Thanks Needa
- 11:53:15 From alicia parker : Thank you Needa. That was very powerful.
- 11:53:18 From amara tabor-smith : NEEDA!!!! that was so deep!
- 11:53:27 From liz suk : Thanks Needa. Such valuable information.
- 11:53:44 From Ayodele Nzinga : Like Ms. Margret says — when do we consider legal recourse to a 14 year trend
- 11:53:46 From James E Vann : Great c0verage 0f many c0mplicagted issues, Needa ... thank y0u
- 11:54:17 From Ayodele Nzinga : How can it be ignored?
- 11:54:31 From amara tabor-smith : THAT PART!

Community Education Workshop #2

- 11:54:33 From Margaretta Lin : The City of Berkeley is working on municipal reparations right now.
- 11:56:20 From amara tabor-smith : yes, sister Ayodele, it is a form of genocide
- 11:59:14 From liz suk : it's a simultaneous act. Changing hearts and minds while pushing to make the change.
- 11:59:32 From Ms.Margaret Gordon : Here are more data on Housing: 1989 earthquake didn't replace the one to one SRO unit that where disaster 2. Hope VI reduce the number of units in public housing and market rate homes 3. Housing Authority give Bridge Housing authority redesign public housing
- 11:59:33 From liz suk : We don't have time for the system to change their hearts.
- 11:59:40 From Ayodele Nzinga : So our input needs to strongly look at what redress looks like ---
- 11:59:55 From Ayodele Nzinga : How do we undo while we doing
- 12:01:06 From Ayodele Nzinga : They are shaping the demographic of the city
- 12:01:16 From Ayodele Nzinga : yup
- 12:03:11 From Ayodele Nzinga : And robustly supporting organizing based in community as a form of continuity
- 12:03:24 From Ayodele Nzinga : Public officials are transitory
- 12:03:34 From amara tabor-smith : Needa- SAY THAT!
- 12:03:42 From liz suk : that's right!?
- 12:03:44 From liz suk : !!!
- 12:06:06 From Needa Bee : villageoakland@gmsil.com
- 12:06:12 From Ayodele Nzinga : What are all the ways in which create enforceable policy/law that represents being able to breath in Oakland
- 12:06:16 From Needa Bee : 510.355.7010
- 12:06:19 From Ayodele Nzinga : N'Corbra
- 12:06:36 From Ayodele Nzinga : There are many city movements for reparations
- 12:07:01 From Needa Bee : oh sorry that was a direct response to Mr. Arthur
- 12:07:18 From alicia parker : Is N'cobra Oakland specific?
- 12:07:32 From Ayodele Nzinga : No
- 12:07:41 From Ms.Margaret Gordon : As long as we know that City of Oakland are connected to Developers and Policy people see black, brown, yellow and red people are not welcome in Oakland there is about keeping fight on the legal front with lawyers
- 12:08:06 From Margaretta Lin : I need a quick bio break. Will be right back.
- 12:08:10 From Ayodele Nzinga : SF conversation happening, LA conversation happening and other places
- 12:08:14 From Marquita Price : like the word equity
- 12:08:52 From Marquita Price : Black is social construct not a nationality
- 12:08:57 From Ayodele Nzinga : Thank you

Community Education Workshop #2

- 12:09:08 From Ayodele Nzinga : Marquita
- 12:09:32 From amara tabor-smith : imperialist, white supremacist, capitalist patriarchy is a shapeshifter. Language is tricky and quickly gets commodified under this system.
- 12:10:52 From Margaretta Lin : Thank you Keta for speaking your truth.
- 12:11:23 From Ayodele Nzinga : How do we heal internally from the trauma we live in and live with
- 12:13:20 From liz suk : Thank you for speaking your truth Marquita.
- 12:14:12 From Margaretta Lin : We appreciate your courage and your voice Keta. And your work for community.
- 12:14:21 From amara tabor-smith : yes, sister Ayodele...we need to give attention to ongoing healing of the trauma...otherwise, the internalized oppression gets in the way.....and yes, Kita- how do we have spaces to be heard and heal from the trauma of doing this work?
- 12:14:23 From alicia parker : Don't want to be exhausted... how do we better cohabitate? Thank you Keta!
- 12:14:36 From Esther Goolsby : adosfoundation.org is the ADOS link/ it was ADOS101.com The American Descendants of Slavery (ADOS) Advocacy Foundation is a grassroots organization that arose in response to a national landscape rife with yawning racialized gaps.
- With an eye toward the origins of these asymmetrical outcomes located in the institution of slavery, our organization prioritizes reparations for descendants of chattel slavery in the United States of America.the work has been going on for years as they speak for black americans. There is a difference from flat black.
- 12:15:36 From Marquita Price : I appreciate that truth. Thank you Needa!
- 12:16:40 From amara tabor-smith : Yes, Needa, yes so hard but necessary to have that conversation
- 12:17:06 From amara tabor-smith : I would like to be a part of that conversation too needa and Keta
- 12:17:23 From alicia parker : Mr. Vann!
- 12:19:34 From liz suk : Nikki Fortunato Bas
- 12:19:36 From Margaretta Lin : Thank you for your wisdom James Vann and your decades of fighting for housing as a human right for all Oaklanders.
- 12:21:40 From liz suk : That could be a city council resolution?
- 12:21:45 From liz suk : or a ballot measure?
- 12:21:57 From liz suk : To change the city charter?
- 12:24:13 From liz suk : 8 years of Libby Schaaf

Community Education Workshop #2

12:25:22 From Margareta Lin : We don't need a city charter change for this City Council to adopt Housing as a Human Right and a moratorium on market rate housing. City has the power to do that right now.

12:26:05 From liz suk : This November we are voting for District 2,4, 6 and Mayor.

12:26:13 From Margareta Lin : The County created a partnership w/ churches using Measure A1 funds for affordable housing on church land.

12:26:59 From Margareta Lin : Who's the Mayor sets the tone for City departments.

12:27:22 From Margareta Lin : When Ron Dellums was mayor, he told Dept directors that their job was to advance racial & social justice.

12:27:26 From amara tabor-smith : YES, MS. MARGARET!!!

12:28:38 From James E Vann : I suggest a new zoning concept be considered called "preferential zoning." Under preferential zoning, "affordable housing zoning could be introduced that would offer subsidies and incentives for specific A.H. developments.

12:29:49 From DONNA HumanGood : Yes Margaret Gordon

12:29:55 From Esther Goolsby : and East Oakland fight for land that AB&I Foundry will try to develop since they are leaving to kill a community in TX . We need everyone to understand the green washing that happens here and the "jobs" over meaning vs. "environment and community health"